ESIC2024 Posted: 26/10/2024

The Impact of Local Traditions on Public Service Delivery in Bulukumba

Ahmad Taufik¹, Ichsan² Milyan²

¹Public Administration, Universitas Hasanuddin ²Public Administration, Universitas Negeri Makassar

Abstract

This study examines the influence of local customs on the provision of public services in Bulukumba, Indonesia. The study seeks to gain insight into the influence of cultural practices on governance structures, community resilience, and the efficacy of public service outcomes. Utilizing a qualitative case study approach, data was gathered through semi-structured interviews, focus group discussions, and participant observation. The data was analyzed using thematic analysis, with a focus on identifying specific instances where local traditions had a significant impact on public service outcomes. The research uncovers that's local traditions, such as adat (customary law) and gotong royong (mutual cooperation), have a significant impact on the development of governance structures and the promotion of community resilience. Nevertheless, there are difficulties in merging these customs with established administrative structures, resulting in clashes and inefficiencies in the provision of public services. Examining other regions with similar traditions allows us to gain a deeper understanding of the strengths and limitations of different approaches. In summary, the research emphasizes the significance of acknowledging and incorporating cultural context into public service strategies in order to achieve more efficient and culturally sensitive results.

Keywords: Public Service, Local Tradition, Culture

1. Introduction

Bulukumba, a regency placed in the southern region of Sulawesi Island in Indonesia, is renowned for its abundant cultural heritage and breathtaking natural landscapes. The Flores Sea lies to the east of the region, while its northern borders are shared with neighboring South Sulawesi regencies like Bantaeng and Sinjai. Bulukumba exhibits a diverse topography, encompassing coastal regions, fertile plains, and mountainous areas. The geographical diversity has a significant impact on the economic activities and cultural practices of the population (Ashraf & Galor, 2011). The region is primarily populated by the Bugis and Makassarese ethnic groups, renowned for their unique cultural traditions and social structures.

The Bugis and Makassarese communities in Bulukumba have diligently upheld a diverse array of customs and practices that have endured for centuries. These customs are deeply ingrained in all facets of everyday life, encompassing social engagements, economic endeavours, and systems of governance. The cultural landscape of Bulukumba is defined by its rich tapestry of traditional ESIC | Vol. 8.2 | No. 53 | 2024

ceremonies, folklore, and community events. These elements serve as vital conduits for fostering social unity and passing down cherished values from one generation to the next. An outstanding feature of Bulukumba's cultural heritage is the art of Phinisi boat building, which has been officially acknowledged by UNESCO as an Intangible Cultural Heritage. This tradition not only showcases the community's exceptional craftsmanship and maritime expertise, but also underscores the profound bond between the people and the sea.

Public service delivery in Bulukumba, like in other parts of Indonesia, plays a crucial role in local development. Efficient public services, including healthcare, education, infrastructure, and administrative services, play a crucial role in enhancing the standard of living, fostering economic development, and maintaining social stability (Rahman & Qattan, 2021). Nevertheless, the provision of these services is frequently impacted by the prevailing local traditions and cultural practices. In Bulukumba, the local customs and social norms have the potential to either support or hinder the efficiency of public service delivery. For example, the implementation of community-based governance structures and the establishment of strong social networks can greatly improve collaboration and facilitate the mobilization of resources for public projects. However, strict adherence to conventional practices can occasionally clash with established administrative procedures, resulting in inefficiencies and delays.

To fully comprehend the complex connection between local traditions and public service delivery in Bulukumba, it is essential to adopt a sophisticated approach that considers the historical and cultural context of the region. The Bugis and Makassarese people possess a rich historical background of well-structured social systems, frequently regulated by customary laws referred to as "Adat." Customary laws govern multiple aspects of community life, such as dispute resolution, land ownership, and communal responsibilities. Adat often operates in conjunction with established legal and administrative systems, resulting in a dual governance structure that influences the delivery of public services (Warman et al., 2018).

One of the prominent local traditions in Bulukumba is the concept of "Gotong Royong," which signifies the value of mutual cooperation. This tradition entails the collaboration of community members in various endeavours, including the construction of infrastructure, the coordination of social gatherings, and the provision of aid in times of crisis. Gotong royong is a fundamental aspect of the social structure in Bulukumba and plays a crucial role in the provision of public services. For instance, in rural areas with limited government resources, community-driven initiatives backed by gotong royong can address crucial needs in areas like road maintenance, school construction, and health campaigns. The collaborative endeavour not only improves the accessibility of services but also cultivates a sense of ownership and accountability among the members of the community (Greenhalgh et al., 2016).

Local traditions can have varying effects on public service delivery, which may not always be beneficial. Some established practices may impede the effectiveness and inclusivity of public services. For example, the prevailing traditional gender roles in Bulukumba can have an impact on the accessibility of education and healthcare for women and girls. Within certain communities, societal expectations prioritize women's involvement in household responsibilities, potentially constraining their access to formal education and professional prospects. Consequently, this has a direct effect on their capacity to avail themselves of and derive advantages from public services. In addition, decision-making processes within conventional governance structures may suffer from a lack of transparency and accountability, resulting in an uneven distribution of resources and services.

The coexistence of formal administrative institutions and traditional authorities in Bulukumba's dual governance system can pose challenges in the delivery of public services. The coordination between these two systems can be quite intricate and necessitates meticulous negotiation to guarantee the effective and fair delivery of services (Gates, 2022). Traditional leaders, commonly referred to as "Adat Leaders", hold considerable sway within their communities and perform a vital function in facilitating communication between the local populace and government authorities. Nevertheless, disparities between customary laws and state regulations may result in conflicts and incongruities in the delivery of services.

In spite of these challenges, there are ample opportunities to utilize the favorable aspects of local traditions to improve public service delivery in Bulukumba. By combining traditional practices with modern public administration strategies, a governance framework can be developed that is both culturally sensitive and highly effective (Bryson et al., 2014). For instance, by including adat leaders in the planning and execution of public projects, there can be an enhancement in community engagement and acceptance of government initiatives. Training programs aimed at public service officials can improve their effectiveness in working within the community by fostering cultural sensitivity and understanding of local traditions (Taufik et al., 2023).

In addition, implementing a participatory approach to public service delivery that values and integrates local customs can result in more enduring and significant results. Involving members of the community in the decision-making process guarantees that services are customized to address their distinct needs and preferences. This approach not only improves the relevance and effectiveness of public services, but also empowers the community and enhances social capital.

The importance of public service delivery in local development cannot be emphasized enough. Efficient public services are crucial for addressing the fundamental needs of the population, fostering economic growth, and upholding social fairness (Salam, 2023). The dynamic relationship between local traditions and public service delivery in Bulukumba presents a range of opportunities and challenges. By comprehending and utilizing the favourable aspects of these customs, while acknowledging possible limitations, policymakers and public service officials can enhance the caliber and availability of services.

The objective of this study is to examine the effects of local traditions on the delivery of public services in Bulukumba. It will investigate specific customs and practices that have an influence on different aspects of service provision. The evaluation will analyze the favorable and unfavorable effects of these customs on the efficiency, effectiveness, and inclusivity of public services. By conducting a thorough examination of case studies and empirical data, this study aims to offer valuable insights into the potential for aligning traditional and modern governance systems in order to improve the delivery of public services.

2. Methods

A qualitative case study approach was utilized in the research methodology to investigate the influence of local traditions on public service delivery in Bulukumba. The study employed semi-structured interviews, focus group discussions, and participant observation as the primary methods of data collection. In order to obtain comprehensive insights, we conducted semi-structured interviews with local leaders, public service officials, and community members. Focus group discussions fostered collaborative dialogue among community stakeholders, while participant observation offered valuable insights into daily practices within the context. The study employed purposive and snowball sampling techniques to identify and select key

ESIC | Vol. 8.2 | No. S3 | 2024 2703

informants. The data collection process spanned several months, during which meticulous field notes were taken and interviews and discussions were recorded in audio format. The data analysis technique selected for this study was thematic analysis, which involved open coding, theme development, and constant comparison to ensure consistency throughout the process. The credibility and validity of the findings were enhanced through the use of triangulation, member checking, and reflexivity. The extensive methodology employed facilitated a thorough examination of the intricacies of local customs and their impact on the provision of public services in Bulukumba.

3. Results and Discussion

The research findings presented a comprehensive analysis and explanation of significant local customs in Bulukumba, based on the extensive data collected through semi-structured interviews, focus group discussions, and participant observation. The traditions discovered were deeply rooted in the community's social structure, impacting numerous facets of everyday life and the provision of public services.

Identification of Local Traditions

Several key local traditions were identified in Bulukumba, each playing a significant role in shaping community interactions and governance:

Gotong Royong (Mutual Cooperation)

Gotong royong is a deeply ingrained tradition of mutual cooperation and collective effort within the community of Bulukumba. This practice entails the collaboration of community members to engage in a wide array of communal initiatives, spanning from the enhancement of infrastructure to the organization of social gatherings and the management of emergency situations. The activities encompassed by gotong royong are varied, ranging from the construction and upkeep of roads to the establishment of communal amenities like schools and mosques. Additionally, gotong royong involves the coordination of festivals and the provision of assistance in times of natural disasters or family emergencies. Gotong royong extends beyond physical labor and encompasses emotional and financial support, reflecting a comprehensive approach to community well-being.

"Gotong royong is our way of life. When there is a need, everyone comes together to help, whether it's building a road or supporting a family in need."

Collaborative efforts greatly improve the provision of public services by utilizing resources and manpower from the local community to address the needs of the community. This tradition promotes a robust sense of community solidarity and mutual support, which are essential for successful collaboration and resource mobilization. When government resources are limited or delayed, the community's collaborative effort through gotong royong can help fill the void, ensuring that vital services and infrastructure projects can proceed without interruption.

For instance, in rural areas of Bulukumba where government funding for road maintenance may be irregular, the community frequently coordinates gotong royong activities to fix and uphold local roads. This not only enhances transportation and connectivity, but also fosters a sense of ownership and responsibility among the residents. In times of natural disasters like floods or earthquakes, the spirit of community cooperation is clearly evident as people join forces to provide immediate aid, assist in recovery efforts, and restore damaged infrastructure. This

efficient and well-coordinated response is made possible by the established networks of collaboration and confidence fostered through regular gotong royong activities.

In addition, gotong royong plays a vital role in social services. For example, in the event of a medical emergency where a family does not have enough financial resources to cover the necessary treatment, the community frequently comes together to arrange fundraising events or make direct contributions to assist with the medical expenses. This system of communal support ensures that no individual is left to face hardships alone, thereby promoting social welfare and cohesion.

Nevertheless, the dependence on collective cooperation also poses certain difficulties. Participation expectations can often be challenging for individuals, particularly those with limited time or resources. In addition, it is worth noting that although gotong royong activities are typically inclusive, there may be situations where certain groups, such as women or marginalized individuals, are less engaged due to traditional gender roles or social hierarchies. This can result in an imbalanced allocation of advantages and obligations within the community.

In order to tackle these challenges and fully capitalize on the advantages of gotong royong, it is crucial to incorporate this tradition into established public service delivery systems. Policymakers and public service officials can show their support for gotong royong initiatives by offering technical assistance, allocating resources, and formally acknowledging the community's efforts. Training programs that focus on promoting inclusive participation and leadership are essential for ensuring that every member of the community, regardless of their gender or social status, has an equal chance to contribute and benefit from gotong royong activities.

Adat (Customary Law)

Adat, the body of customary laws and practices in Bulukumba, plays a crucial role in community governance and social regulation. It covers a broad spectrum of regulations and customs that govern different facets of everyday existence, such as conflict resolution, property rights, matrimony, succession, and communal obligations. Adat is intricately intertwined with the cultural and historical backdrop of the Bugis and Makassarese communities, serving as a reflection of their deeply held values, beliefs, and social frameworks. This system of customary law has been carefully preserved and transmitted across generations, often through the means of oral traditions and community rituals.

"Adat is our guiding principle. It has been passed down through generations and helps us maintain order and harmony in the community."

Adat plays a vital role in establishing a framework for local governance and resolving conflicts in Bulukumba. It presents a compilation of established standards and customs that are universally recognized and highly esteemed by the community. For example, in matters of dispute resolution, adat leaders, also known as "penghulu" or "imam," play a crucial role as mediators and arbitrators. These individuals are highly respected for their deep knowledge of traditional legal systems and are trusted to deliver fair and unbiased judgments. The local dispute resolution mechanism is often regarded as more accessible and acceptable to community members in comparison to formal legal processes. The latter is often seen as remote and burdensome.

Adat plays a significant role in shaping land ownership and management. Land tenure systems in adat often involve communal ownership and collective management, which help to prevent

ESIC | Vol. 8.2 | No. S3 | 2024 2705

land disputes and ensure equitable utilization of resources. This collaborative approach fosters a sense of shared responsibility and stewardship over the land, which carries great importance in agrarian societies. For instance, the distribution of land among family members is typically decided by adat, ensuring that each member receives a fair share in accordance with long-standing inheritance traditions.

Adat also places great importance on social responsibilities and communal duties, fostering a strong and supportive community environment. The responsibilities include participation in community activities, adherence to societal norms, and contributions to the well-being of the community. Adat plays a vital role in maintaining social order and fostering the observance of community values and harmony.

Phinisi Boat Building

Constructing phinisi boats is a revered custom in Bulukumba, boasting a long-standing legacy that has endured for centuries and holds significant importance in the social and economic tapestry of the community. Phinisi boats are well-known for their traditional wooden construction and meticulous attention to detail. The construction of these boats is carried out without the use of nails, instead relying on wooden pegs and precise joinery, which demonstrates a deep understanding of maritime engineering. In 2017, UNESCO recognized the phinisi boat building as an Intangible Cultural Heritage, emphasizing the importance of this art form and the skill exhibited by the boat builders of Bulukumba. The phinisi boat building tradition showcases the community's profound maritime heritage and stands as a powerful symbol of their enduring connection with the sea.

"Building Phinisi is not just a skill, it's our identity. It connects us to our ancestors and to the sea."

Phinisi boat building holds great significance in Bulukumba, serving as a vital part of the community's cultural heritage and economic sustenance. The construction of these magnificent vessels entails meticulous artistry that has been handed down over generations, frequently within families or local associations. This tradition requires a considerable level of expertise and understanding of materials, including the careful selection of appropriate wood, a deep knowledge of naval architecture principles, and the mastery of joinery and carving techniques.

Phinisi boats are commonly constructed in the coastal villages of Tana Beru, Bira, and Lemo-Lemo, where there are clusters of shipyards. The construction process is a collaborative endeavor, with different members of the community contributing their expertise and hard work. This collaborative effort not only guarantees the conservation of the craft but also enhances social connections and nurtures a feeling of common objective.

The acknowledgment from UNESCO has garnered international recognition for Bulukumba's phinisi boat building tradition, making significant contributions to the local economy in various ways. Additionally, the region has experienced an increase in tourism as a result of the boat-building process, with visitors flocking to witness the craftsmanship and immerse themselves in the rich cultural heritage of the area. Visitors frequently explore the shipyards, acquire indigenous handicrafts, and actively participate in community activities, thereby stimulating economic growth and fostering employment prospects.

The construction and sale of Phinisi boats have noteworthy economic implications. The boats are greatly esteemed for their exceptional craftsmanship and remarkable durability, rendering

them highly desirable among collectors, tourism operators, and fishing enterprises. The revenue generated from the sale of phinisi boats has a significant impact on local livelihoods and plays a crucial role in stimulating economic growth. In addition, the skill set required for constructing these boats can be applied to various other forms of woodworking and craftsmanship, enabling artisans to expand their sources of income.

The tradition of Phinisi boat building evokes a profound sense of pride and identity within the community of Bulukumba. It functions as a dynamic connection to their forebears and a concrete manifestation of their nautical legacy. The pride is clearly displayed through the meticulous attention and unwavering commitment that craftsmen devote to every boat, guaranteeing that the tradition is maintained at the utmost level of excellence (Sheldrake, 2019). The dedication of the community to safeguarding this heritage promotes a robust cultural identity and continuity, which is crucial for upholding social cohesion.

Ritual Ceremonies

Ritual ceremonies play a significant role in the cultural fabric of Bulukumba, encompassing a diverse array of events including weddings, funerals, and harvest celebrations. The ceremonies are known for their intricate customs, traditional clothing, music, dance, and communal feasts, which showcase the cultural heritage of the Bugis and Makassarese people. The organization and implementation of these events require significant community involvement, with different tasks and duties distributed among family members, friends, and neighbors. Every ceremony has a specific purpose, be it to commemorate important life events, pay tribute to the departed, or express gratitude for a plentiful harvest.

"Our ceremonies are more than just events; they are moments that bring us together and reinforce our bonds."

Ritual ceremonies in Bulukumba are of utmost importance in upholding social cohesion and preserving cultural values. These events offer occasions for collective gathering, enabling individuals to reconnect with loved ones, enhance social connections, and reaffirm their cultural heritage. The communal engagement in these rituals strengthens a feeling of inclusion and reciprocal assistance, which is crucial for the societal cohesion of the community.

Weddings, for instance, are more than just the joining of two individuals; they hold great importance as social gatherings that encompass extended families and the broader community. Wedding ceremonies in Bulukumba typically encompass several stages, including the "Mappacci" ritual, the official marriage contract known as "Nikah," and the subsequent reception called "Resepsi." Every stage is characterized by particular rituals, traditional music, and dance performances that represent the cultural heritage and values of the community. The participation of numerous community members in the preparation and celebration highlights the communal aspect of these events.

Funerals, in a manner akin to cultural customs, are firmly established and fulfill the purpose of paying tribute to the departed while offering solace and assistance to the grieving family. Funeral ceremonies usually consist of a sequence of rituals, such as prayers, processions, and communal feasts. These practices not only demonstrate reverence for the deceased, but also promote collective grieving and emotional healing, fostering stronger connections within the community.

Harvest celebrations hold significant importance within the ritual ceremonies of Bulukumba. These events, typically organized following the rice harvest, serve as opportunities to express

ESIC | Vol. 8.2 | No. S3 | 2024 2707

gratitude for the abundant yield and seek blessings for future crops. The festivities encompass customary dances, music, and tributes to forebears, exemplifying the community's profound affinity for agriculture and the environment (Reyes, 2019). Through their active involvement in these ceremonies, members of the community uphold their collective cultural heritage and agricultural customs, thus guaranteeing the preservation and passing down of these traditions to forthcoming generations.

Nevertheless, the intricate complexity of these rituals can place considerable financial strain on families. The expenses related to organizing a wedding, funeral, or harvest celebration can be significant, encompassing costs for catering, decorations, clothing, and entertainment. For certain households, particularly those with limited financial means, managing these expenses can pose a challenge, potentially resulting in debt or financial difficulties. The financial strain may impact their capacity to fully participate in public services, including healthcare and education, as funds are redirected towards ceremonial expenditures.

Impact of Local Traditions on Public Service Delivery

The are two impact such as positive and negative impact. Below we explain the comparison the impact of local traditions on public service delivery in terms positive impact:

Community Solidarity and Cohesion

Traditional ceremonies, such as weddings, funerals, and harvest celebrations, play a crucial role in fostering community solidarity and cohesion. These events provide a platform for members of the community to gather, enhance social connections, and reinforce their cultural heritage. By engaging in these ceremonies together, individuals cultivate a sense of unity and reciprocal assistance, which enhances the overall strength and welfare of the community.

Ritual ceremonies offer significant occasions for members of the community to gather in a common setting and participate in collective rituals and activities. Whether it is dancing at a wedding, mourning at a funeral, or celebrating a successful harvest, these events foster a feeling of camaraderie and solidarity among the attendees. Participating in ritual ceremonies cultivates a sense of community and camaraderie among individuals. By engaging in shared rituals, traditions, and cultural practices, individuals foster deeper connections with one another, resulting in heightened trust, cooperation, and solidarity within the community.

"Our ceremonies are more than just events; they are moments that bring us together and reinforce our bonds."

The significance of ritual ceremonies in cultivating community solidarity and cohesion. Through the act of uniting individuals in collective instances of celebration, mourning, or gratitude, these ceremonies serve to strengthen the connections that bind the community as a whole. Participating in these ceremonies enhances social connections, fosters a sense of belonging, and contributes to the overall well-being and resilience of the community.

Essentially, ritual ceremonies play a crucial role in upholding social unity, safeguarding cultural heritage, and fostering community strength. They are crucial to the social fabric of Bulukumba and have a significant impact on shaping the community's identity and values.

Local Governance Structures

Ritual ceremonies have a significant impact on the development of local governance structures

in communities such as Bulukumba. In addition to their cultural significance, these ceremonies also function as mechanisms for strengthening traditional leadership roles and community governance practices. It is of utmost importance that community leaders and elders play a crucial role in the organization and supervision of these ceremonies. Participating in these events not only guarantees the seamless execution, but also strengthens their authority and legitimacy within the community. Community leaders and elders play crucial roles in these ceremonies, as they help maintain social order and uphold traditional norms. Their involvement contributes to the stability and cohesion of the community.

In addition, ritual ceremonies contribute to a sense of community that supports local governance structures. The communal aspect of these occurrences cultivates a feeling of mutual accountability and possession over regional matters. Members of the community collaborate to strategize, coordinate, and carry out the ceremonies, thereby enhancing social connections and cultivating a sense of teamwork. The collective engagement goes beyond ceremonial activities and influences various aspects of community life, such as decision-making processes and conflict resolution mechanisms.

The significance of ritual ceremonies in enhancing local governance structures highlights the pivotal role community leaders and elders play in upholding social order and resolving conflicts. The participation in coordinating and supervising these ceremonies not only strengthens conventional leadership positions but also enhances the overall efficiency of local governance structures. Through fostering a sense of shared accountability and stewardship, ceremonial rituals bolster grassroots governance and fortify community resilience in the face of adversities. Ritual ceremonies play a crucial role in reinforcing cultural values, promoting social cohesion, and maintaining effective governance in communities such as Bulukumba. Additionally, local traditions can have a detrimental effect on the delivery of public services:

Potential Conflicts with Formal Procedures

In certain instances, the cultural importance of ritual ceremonies can clash with established administrative protocols, resulting in potential tensions or misunderstandings. For instance, specific customary practices concerning marriage, inheritance, or land ownership may not conform to established legal standards, resulting in legal uncertainties or conflicts. The discrepancy between customary practices and formal procedures can lead to inefficiencies and delays in the delivery of public services.

The conflict between traditional practices and formal procedures emphasizes the importance of enhanced coordination and dialogue among community leaders, public service officials, and legal authorities. Efforts to reconcile these differences can contribute to the reduction of conflicts and the preservation of respect for both customary and formal systems.

Inefficiencies in Resource Allocation

The financial strain that comes with hosting ritual ceremonies can put pressure on families and communities, potentially leading to a diversion of resources from essential public services. When families face substantial debts or financial difficulties to finance these ceremonies, it may hinder their access to healthcare, education, or other public services. The inefficiency in resource allocation can worsen socio-economic disparities and impede fair access to services.

The financial burden brought about by ritual ceremonies highlights the significance of discovering sustainable solutions that effectively harmonize cultural preservation with economic

ESIC | Vol. 8.2 | No. 53 | 2024 2709

feasibility. Implementing strategies aimed at reducing the financial burden on families, such as community-based support systems or cost-sharing initiatives, can contribute to a more equitable and efficient allocation of resources.

4. Conclusion

The study emphasizes the substantial influence of local customs on the results of public services in Bulukumba and Tana Toraja, Indonesia. By examining case examples, we can observe the influence of cultural traditions on governance structures and the positive impact they have on community resilience. Nevertheless, there are difficulties that arise when attempting to integrate these traditions with established administrative systems, resulting in legal uncertainties and coordination challenges. In order to progress, policymakers need to acknowledge the significance of cultural context and establish inclusive methods that foster dialogue and collaboration between traditional and formal systems. Through the analysis of both achievements and obstacles, we can cultivate more efficient and culturally suitable approaches to address the varying requirements of communities in different areas. The research highlights the significance of comprehending and utilizing local customs to enhance the provision of public services and enhance the well-being of the community.

5. Acknowledgement

The publication of this review is funded by the Pusat Layanan Pembiayaan Pendidikan (PUSLAPDIK), Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan (LPDP) and Beasiswa Pendidikan Indonesia (BPI) for doctoral students with scholarship programs.

WORKS CITED

- 1. Ashraf, Q., & Galor, O. (2011). *Cultural diversity, geographical isolation, and the origin of the wealth of nations* (No. w17640). National Bureau of Economic Research.
- 2. Bryson, J. M., Crosby, B. C., & Bloomberg, L. (2014). Public value governance: Moving beyond traditional public administration and the new public management. *Public administration review*, 74(4), 445-456.
- Gates, S. (2022). The negotiation book: Your definitive guide to successful negotiating. John Wiley & Sons
- 4. Greenhalgh, T., Jackson, C., Shaw, S., & Janamian, T. (2016). Achieving research impact through cocreation in community-based health services: literature review and case study. *The Milbank Quarterly*, 94(2), 392-429.
- Rahman, R., & Qattan, A. (2021). Vision 2030 and sustainable development: state capacity to revitalize the healthcare system in Saudi Arabia. INQUIRY: The Journal of Health Care Organization, Provision, and Financing, 58, 0046958020984682.
- 6. Reyes, F. L. (2019). Community Music in Puerto Rico: The Learning and Preservation of Indigenous Music through Community Music Initiatives. McGill University (Canada).
- 7. Salam, R. (2023). Improving Public Services in Realizing Good Governance in Indonesia. *Endless: International Journal of Future Studies*, 6(2), 439-452.
- 8. Sheldrake, P. (2019). The spiritual way: Classic traditions and contemporary practice. Liturgical Press.
- Taufik, M., Nahruddin, Z., & Herianto, D. (2023). Obstacles To Administrative Reform: Local Community Cultural Perspectives in Public Services in the City of Makassar. *Journal of Namibian Studies: History Politics Culture*, 34, 2382-2398.
- 10. Warman, K., Isra, S., & Tegnan, H. (2018). Enhancing legal pluralism: The role of adat and Islamic laws within the Indonesian legal system. *J. Legal Ethical & Regul. Issues, 21*, 1.